## From Mullā 'Alī al-Qārī's *Al-Asrār al-Marfū'a* (Reference-Book on Forgeries) Translation and Notes by GF Haddad - Sha'bān 1427

The Ink of the ulema is dearer (afdalu) than the blood of the shuhadā'. Al-Khaṭīb said it is forged.¹ Al-Zarkashī mentioned it and said it was a saying of al-Ḥasan al-Baṣrī.² It is also narrated from the Prophet in the wording:

"The ink of the ulema was weighed against the blood of the shuhada" and outweighed it."

Al-Sakhāwī said Ibn 'Abd al-Barr narrated it from Abū al-Dardā' \$\mathbb{\pi}\$, from the Prophet \$\mathbb{\pi}\$, as follows:

"On the Day of Resurrection, the ink of the scholars will be weighed against the blood of the shuhadā' and outweigh it." 3

Al-Khaṭīb in his Tārīkh narrated from Nāfi<sup>c</sup>, from Ibn <sup>c</sup>Umar C, from the Prophet 4:

"The ink of the ulema was weighed against the blood of the shuhada" and outweighed it."

Its chain contains Muḥammad ibn [al-Ḥasan al-Qaṭāyi'ī]<sup>4</sup> who was accused of forgery. However, the meaning is true because the usefulness of the blood of the *shahīd* is confined to him while the usefulness of the scholar's pen benefits others and is enduring.<sup>5</sup>

¹ As did al-Dhahabī (*Mīzān* 3:517) and Ahmad al-Ghumārī but al-Simʿānī narrates it [1] from Abū Hurayra in *Adab al-Imlā' wal-Istimlā'* (p. 162) with a chain of narrators all used by Muslim in his Ṣaḥāḥ and al-ʿIrāqī said in his major *Takhrīj* of the *Ilyā*. "This hadīth with the chain [2] from al-Nuʿmān ibn Bashīr C [in Ibn al-Jawzī's *'Ial* and *Tārīkh Jurjān*] is good and fair (jayyid hasan)" as cited in the Ryadh edition of al-Dhahabī's *Talkhīṣ al-ʿIlal al-Mutanāhiya* (p. 35 n. 1). The chains that are very weak are those [3] from Abū al-Dardā' in Ibn 'Abd al-Barr; [4] Ibn 'Umar C in al-Khaṭīb's *Tārīkh Baghdād* (2:193), Ibn al-Jawzī's *'Ial al-Mutanāhiya* (1:71), Ibn al-Najjār's *Tārīkh*, and al-Daylamī with various chains, the latter through 'Abd al-'Azīz ibn Abī Rawwād from Nāfi' [Ibn Ḥibbān said in *al-Majrūḥīn* (2:136): "Abd al-'Azīz] narrates undoubted forgeries from Nāfi'"]; and [5] 'Abd Allāh ibn 'Amr C in Ibn al-Jawzī. The hadīth is also narrated [6] from 'Imrān ibn Ḥuṣayn by Abū al-'Abbās al-Marhabī in *Fadl al-ʿIlm*, [7] Anas by al-Shīrāzī, and [8] Ibn 'Abbās by Ibn al-Najjār cf. al-Suyūṭī in *al-Durr al-Mathhūr* and *Kanz al-ʿUmmāl*. As for those that claim that this hadīth contradicts the verse Those of the believers who sit still, other than those who have a (disabling) hurt, are not on an equality with those who strive in the way of Allāh with their wealth and lives. Rather, the Ulema are the fiercest and most selfless fighters in His path as can be gleaned from Abū Ghudda's book *Ṣafaḥāt min Ṣabr al-ʿUlamā*' and Asʿad al-Khaṭīb's al-Buṭūlatu wal-Fidā' 'inda al-Ṣūfiyya.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> As narrated by the Abū Yaʿqūb Ishāq ibn Ibrāhīm al-Manjanīqī al-Baghdādī in *Riwāyat al-Kibār ʿan al-Ṣighār* and as stated by al-Sakhāwī in the *Maqāṣid* (p. 377), al-Samhūdī in *Jawāhir al-ʿAqdayn fi Faḍl al-Sharafayn Sharaf al-ʿIlmi wal-Nasab* (p. 40), Marʿi al-Karmī in *al-Fawāʾid al-Mawdūʿa* (p. 107), al-Shawkānī in *al-Fawāʾid al-Majmūʿa* (p. 287), al-Suyūṭī, al-ʿAjlūnī, al-Fattanī and others

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> In Jāmi Bayān Faḍl al-ʿIlm (1:150) through the Qāḍī of Mawṣil, Ismā ʿīl ibn Abī Ziyād al-Zakūnī, whom Ibn Ḥibbān called an arch-liar (dajjāl).

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Corrupted to "Muḥammad ibn Ja'far" in the mss. and corrected from al-Khaṭīb.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> It is fairer to say that the usefulness of both the scholar and the *shahīd* is immense and benefits as many and as long as Allāh wills